Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

1 Comparative transcriptomics reveals lineage specific evolution of

2 cold response in Pooideae

- 3 Lars Grønvold^{1*}, Marian Schubert^{2*}, Simen R. Sandve³, Siri Fjellheim² and Torgeir R.
- 4 Hvidsten^{1,4}
- 5 ^{*}Contributed equally
- ⁶ ¹Department of Chemistry, Biotechnology and Food Science, Norwegian University of Life
- 7 Sciences, NO-1432, Ås, Norway.
- ²Department of Plant Sciences, Norwegian University of Life Sciences, Ås NO-1432, Norway.
- ⁹ ³Centre for Integrative Genetics (CIGENE), Department of Animal and Aquacultural Sciences,
- 10 Norwegian University of Life Sciences, NO-1432, Ås, Norway.
- ⁴Umeå Plant Science Centre, Department of Plant Physiology, Umeå University, SE-90187,
- 12 Umeå, Sweden.
- 13 Author for correspondence:
- 14 Torgeir R. Hvidsten
- 15 Tel: +4767232491
- 16 Email: torgeir.r.hvidsten@nmbu.no

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

17 Abstract

Background: Understanding how complex traits evolve through adaptive changes in gene regulation remains a major challenge in evolutionary biology. Over the last ~50 million years, Earth has experienced climate cooling and ancestrally tropical plants have adapted to expanding temperate environments. The grass subfamily Pooideae dominates the grass flora of the temperate regions, but the role of cold-response gene regulation in the transitioning from tropical to temperate climate remains unexplored.

24 Results: To establish if molecular responses to cold are conserved throughout the phylogeny, we 25 assembled the transcriptomes of five Pooideae species spanning early to later diverging lineages, 26 and compared short- and long-term cold responsive genes using 8633 high confidence ortholog 27 groups with resolved gene tree topologies. We found that a majority of cold responsive genes were specific to one or two lineages, an observation that we deem incompatible with a cold 28 29 adapted Pooideae ancestor. However, all five species shared short-term cold response in a small 30 set of general stress genes as well as the ability to down-regulate the photosynthetic machinery 31 during cold temperatures.

32 Conclusions: Our observations indicate that the different Pooideae lineages have assembled cold
 33 response programs in parallel by taking advantage of a common potential for cold adaptation.

34

Key words: regulatory evolution, cold response, comparative transcriptomics, Pooideae,
 adaptation

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

37 Background

Adaptation to a changing climate is essential for long term evolutionary success of plant lineages. During the last ~50 million years of climate cooling (Fig. 1c), several plant species adapted to temperate regions. A key step in this transitioning was the integration of novel temperate climate cues, such as seasonal fluctuations in temperature, in the regulatory network controlling cold stress responses. Here we used the temperate grass subfamily Pooideae as a model system for studying gene regulatory evolution of cold stress.

The temperate grass flora is dominated by members of the subfamily Pooideae [1], and the most extreme cold environments are inhabited by Pooideae species. The ancestors of this group were, however, most likely adapted to tropical or subtropical climates [2, 3]. Many Pooideae species experience cold winters (Fig. 1b) and although a recent study inferred adaptation to cooler environments at the base of the Pooideae phylogeny [4], it is still not known whether the Pooideae's most recent common ancestor (MRCA) already was adapted to cold stress, or if adaptation to cold evolved independently in the Pooideae lineages.

51 Pooideae is a large subfamily comprising 4200 species [5], amongst them economically 52 important species such as wheat and barley. Given the commercial importance of this group. 53 various aspects of adaptation to temperate climate such as flowering time, cold acclimation, and 54 frost and chilling tolerance have been studied (reviewed by [6-13]). These studies are, however, 55 confined to a handful of species in the species rich, monophyletic clade "core Pooideae" [14] and 56 recently also to its sister clade, containing the model grass *Brachypodium distachyon* [15–17]. It 57 is thus unknown how adaptation to temperate climate evolved in earlier diverging Pooideae 58 lineages to promote the success of this subfamily in temperate regions.

59 Environmental stress is assumed to be a strong evolutionary force, and the colonization of 60 temperate biomes by Pooideae was likely accompanied by adaptation to cold conditions. A 61 MRCA already adapted to cold (the ancestral hypothesis) offers a plausible basis for the 62 ecological success of the Pooideae subfamily in the northern temperate regions [1]. However, 63 paleoclimatic reconstructions infer a generally warm climate, and a very limited abundance of 64 temperate environments, during the time of Pooideae emergence, around 50 million years ago 65 (Mya) [18–22]. Indeed, it was not before ca. 33.5 Mya, during the Eocene-Oligocene (E-O)

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

transition, that the global climates suddenly began to cool [23, 24] (Fig. 1c). Climate cooling at the E-O transition coincided with the emergence of many temperate plant lineages [25] and may have been an important selection pressure for improved cold tolerance in Pooideae [26, 27]. If the E-O cooling event has been the major evolutionary driving force for cold adaptation in Pooideae grasses, those findings lend support for lineage specific evolution of cold adaptation (the lineage specific hypothesis), as all major Pooideae lineages had already emerged by the time of the E-O transition [2, 28] (Fig. 1a).

73 A restricted number of plant lineages successfully transitioned into the temperate region, 74 emphasizing the difficulties in evolving the coordinated set of physiological changes needed to 75 withstand low temperatures [29]. During prolonged freezing, plants need to maintain the integrity of cell membranes to avoid osmotic stress [30]. Cold and freezing tolerance is 76 77 associated with the ability to cold acclimate, which is achieved through a period of extended, 78 non-freezing cold triggered by the gradually lower temperature and day-length in the autumn. 79 During cold acclimation, a suite of physiological changes governed by diverse molecular 80 pathways results in an increase in the sugar content of cells, change in lipid composition of 81 membranes and synthesis of anti-freeze proteins [13, 31]. Also, low non-freezing temperatures 82 may affect plant cells by decreasing metabolic turnover rates, inhibiting the photosynthetic 83 machinery and decreasing stability of biomolecules (e.g. lipid membranes) [10, 12]. Several 84 studies have used transcriptomics to compare cold stress response, however, they focused on 85 closely related taxa or varieties within model species [17, 32-36]. As such, these studies were 86 not able to investigate evolutionary mechanisms underlying adaptation to cold climates of entire 87 clades.

88 Here, we used *de novo* comparative transcriptomics across the Pooideae phylogeny to study the 89 evolution of cold adaptation in Pooideae. Specifically, we aim to establish if molecular responses 90 to cold are conserved in the Pooideae subfamily or if they are the result of lineage specific 91 evolution. The transcriptomes of three non-model species (Nardus stricta, Stipa lagascae and 92 *Melica nutans*), which belong to early diverging lineages, were compared to the transcriptomes 93 of the model grass Brachypodium distachyon and the core Pooideae species Hordeum vulgare 94 (barley). 8633 high confidence ortholog groups with resolved gene tree topologies were used to 95 identify cold-response genes. We found that only a small number of genes were cold responsive

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae



Figure 1. The Pooideae phylogeny, present and historic temperature data and the experimental design of this study. (a) Dated phylogenetic tree of the five Pooideae investigated in this study with O. sativa as an out-species. The species phylogeny was inferred from gene trees, with the distribution of mean gene-tree node ages shown in blue. (b) The range of the minimum temperature of the coldest month (WorldClim v1.4 dataset, Bioclim variable 6, 2.5 km² resolution [95]) at the species geographical distribution (source: www.gbif.org). (c) Oxygen isotope ratios as a proxy for historic global temperature [18, 22] (d) Experimental design. Plants from five species of Pooideae were subjected to a drop in temperature and shorter days to induce cold response. Leaf material was sampled on the day before the onset of cold (W0 and D0), once 8 hours after cold (D1) and two times after 4 and 9 weeks (W4/W9). Short-term response was identified by contrasting gene expression in time points D0 and D1, while long-term response was identified contrasting W0 and W4/W9.

in all the investigated Pooideae species, which suggested that their common ancestor only
 possessed few and possibly key, preliminary cold response mechanisms, and that evolution of
 cold responses evolved primarily independently in different Pooideae lineages.

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

99 **Results**

To investigate the evolution of cold response in Pooideae, we sampled leaf material in five species before and after subjecting them to a drop in temperature and shorter days (Fig. 1d). RNA-sequencing (RNA-Seq) was used to reveal the short and long term cold response of transcripts, and the conservation of these responses was analyzed in the context of ortholog groups.

105 De novo transcriptome assembly identified 8633 high confidence ortholog groups

The transcriptome of each species was assembled *de novo* resulting in 146k-282k contigs, of which 68k-118k were identified as containing coding sequences (CDS, Table S1). Ortholog groups (OGs) were inferred by using the protein sequences from the five *de novo* assemblies, as well as the reference genomes of *L. perenne*, *H. vulgare*, *B. distachyon*, *Oryza sativa*, *Sorghum bicolor* and *Zea mays*. The five assembled Pooideae species were represented with at least one transcript in 24k-33k OGs (Table S1).

Gene trees were generated for each OG and a set of high confidence OGs (HCOGs) was identified by filtering based on the topology of the gene trees (see Methods). This resulted in 8633 high confidence ortholog groups (HCOGs) containing transcripts from at least three of the five studied species (Table S1, Table S2).

116 De novo assembly followed by ortholog detection resulted in higher numbers of monophyletic 117 species-specific paralogs than the number of paralogs in the reference genomes of *H. vulgare* 118 and B. distachyon. This apparent overestimation of paralogs was almost certainly the result of the 119 de novo procedure assembling alleles or alternative transcript isoforms into separate contigs. We 120 also observed some cases where the number of paralogs were under-estimated compared to the 121 references, which may be due to low expression of these paralogs or the assembler collapsing 122 paralogs into single contigs. Since the *de novo* assembly procedure did not reliably assemble 123 paralogs, we chose to represent each species in each HCOG by a single read-count value equal to 124 the sum of the expression of all assembled paralogs. By additionally setting counts for missing 125 orthologs to zero, we created a single cross species expression matrix with HCOGs as rows and 126 samples as columns (Table S3).

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

127 A dated species tree of the Pooideae

128 Dated gene trees were generated using prior knowledge about the divergence times of Oryza-129 Pooideae [37] and Brachypodium-Hordeum [28]. Based on 3914 gene trees with exactly one 130 sequence from each of the five Pooideae and rice (see Methods), a dated species tree was 131 estimated using the mean divergence times of the gene trees (Fig. 1a). In the most common gene 132 tree topology, S. lagascae or M. nutans formed a monophyletic clade, but topologies where 133 either S. lagascae or M. nutans diverged first were also common (Fig. S1). Due to this 134 uncertainty regarding the topology, S. lagascae and M. nutans branches were collapsed to a 135 polytomy in the consensus species tree.

136 *Expression clustering indicated a common global response to cold*

137 To investigate broad scale expression patterns in cold response, we clustered all samples 138 (including replicates) after scaling the expression values of each gene to remove differences in 139 absolute expression between species (see Methods, Fig. 2a). This clustering revealed the differential effects of the treatments and resulted in a tree with replicates, and then time points. 140 141 clustering together. An exception was time points W4 and W9, which tended to cluster together 142 and by species, indicating that responses after 4 and 9 weeks were very similar. The fact that 143 time points mostly clustered together before species indicated a common response to cold across 144 species. We also observed a clear effect of the diurnal rhythm, with time points sampled in the 145 morning (W0, W4 and W9) forming one cluster and time points sampled in the afternoon (D0 146 and D1) forming another.

147 Cold responsive genes were primarily species specific

148 We next examined similarities in short and long term cold response between species by 149 analysing changes in gene expression from before cold treatment to eight hours and 4-9 weeks 150 after cold treatment (Fig. 1d). For all species pairs, there was a low, but statistically significant, 151 correlation between the expression fold changes of orthologs in HCOGs (Fig. 2b). A similar 152 pattern was observed when investigating the number of orthologs classified as differentially 153 expressed in pairs of species (FDR adjusted p-value < 0.05 and fold change > 2, Table S4, see 154 Methods): these numbers were low compared to the number of differentially expressed genes 155 (DEGs) in individual species, but higher than expected by chance (Fisher's exact test p < 0.05,

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae



Figure 2. Comparison of cold response across the Pooideae. (a) Expression clustering of the samples. The tree was generated by neighbor-joining of Manhattan distances given as the sum of log fold changes between all highly expressed genes after subtracting the mean expression per species. Each tip corresponded to one sample. (b) The Pearson correlations of log fold expression changes (only short-term cold response is shown) between pairs of species. The correlations were computed based on the high confidence ortholog groups (HCOG). (c) The number of differentially expressed genes per species and shared between pairs of species. The statistical significance of the overlaps between pairs of species were indicated with odds ratios. (d) The number of differentially expressed genes in each species (FDR adjusted p-value < 0.05 and absolute fold change > 2 in either short- or long-term cold response) and overlap between species.

Fig. 2c). Finally, the number of orthologs with differential expression in more than two species were very low (Fig. 2d), with only 83 DEGs common to all five species. Taken together, these observations suggest that cold response in Pooideae is primarily lineage specific, with low but significant similarities between pairs of species both with respect to fold change and differential expression. Noticeably, neither the similarities in differential expression nor the fold change correlations reflected the phylogenetic relationship between the species, that is, the cold responses of related species were not more similar than that of distantly related species.

163 Shared cold response genes included known abiotic stress genes

164 Sixteen genes shared the same cold response (short- or long-term) in the same direction (up or 165 down) in all five Pooideae species, thus representing a response to cold that might have been

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

Table 1. High confidence ortholog groups with conserved cold response in all five Pooideae. S =short-term response, L =long-term response. $\square =$ up regulated, $\square =$ down regulated. Annotations were inferred from literature using orthologs. These 16 genes were the subset of the 83 genes in Fig. 2d with the same type of cold response (short- or long-term) in the same direction (up- or down-regulation) in all five species.

Bd ortholog	Description and relation to stress response	Response
Bradi2g39230	HyperOSmolality-gated CA2+ permeable channel (OSCA) - Stress-activated calcium channels [65] that are highly conserved in eukaryotes [66]. In <i>Oryza sativa</i> , OSCA genes are differentially expressed in response to osmotic stress [67].	S7
Bradi2g06830	Calcium-binding EF-hand containing calcium exchange channel (EF-CAX) - Calcium ions are important mediators of abiotic stress in plants [68, 69]. Expression of calcium binding proteins correlates with exposure to cold stress in several plants, e.g. <i>Arabidopsis thaliana</i> [30], <i>Musa × paradisiaca</i> [70] and <i>Hordeum vulgare</i> [38].	SZ
Bradi2g05226	GIGANTEA - Promotes flower development in plants [71]. In <i>Arabidopsis thaliana</i> , this gene is involved in CBF-independent freezing tolerance [72, 73], and is responsive to cold in <i>Zea mays</i> [74]. Also part of the circadian clock.	SZ
Bradi4g24967	Arabidopsis Pseudo-Response Regulator 3-like (AtPRR3-like) - AtPRR3 is a member of the circadian clock quintet AtPRR1/TOC1 [75, 76]. No association to stress response found in literature. However, AtPRR3-like might be closer related to AtPRR5/9 than to AtPRR3 (See Bradi4g36077, PRR95).	S⊅
Bradi2g09060	Triacylglycerol lipase, alpha/beta-Hydrolase superfamily - Studies in <i>Arabidopsis thaliana</i> [77] and <i>Ipomoea batatas</i> [78] suggest that genes with alpha/beta-Hydrolase domains respond to osmotic stress. In <i>Triticum monococcum</i> , atriacylglycerol lipase was induced by pathogen stress [79].	SZ
Bradi2g07480	Late-Embryogenesis-Abundant protein 14 (LEA-14) - Responsive to drought, salt and cold stress in <i>Arabidopsis thaliana</i> [80, 81], Betula pubescens [82] and <i>Brachypodium distachyon</i> [83].	SZ
Bradi1g04150	SNAC1-like / NAC transcription factor 67 - NAC transcription factors mediate abiotic stress responses. Osmotic stress increases the expression of SNAC1 in <i>Oryza sativa</i> [84], NAC68 in <i>Musa</i> × <i>paradisiaca</i> [70, 85] and NAC67 <i>Triticum aestivum</i> [86].	SZ
Bradi4g36077	Pseudo-Response Regulator 95 (PRR95) - Homologous to conserved circadian clock gene AtPRR5/9 [87, 88]. AtPRR5 gene is cold regulated in Arabidopsis thaliana [89] and PRR95 is cold responsive in Zea mays [74].	S7
Bradi2g43040	DnaJ chaperon protein - DnaJ co-chaperons are vital in stress response and has been found to be involved in maintenance of photosystem II under chilling stress and enhances drought tolerance in tomato [90, 91].	S+L 🗡
Bradi3g33080	Glycogenin GlucuronosylTransferase (GGT) - GGT belongs to the GT8 protein family [92]. In <i>Oryza sativa</i> , OsGGT transcripts are induced in submerged plants and respond to various abiotic stresses except cold [93, 94].	LZ
Bradi1g04500	Major facilitator superfamily transporter - Association to stress response unknown.	LZ
Bradi3g14080	Glycosyl transferase - Association to stress response unknown.	L7
Bradi1g35357	Uncharacterized membrane protein - Association to stress response unknown.	S7
Bradi2g48850	Uncharacterized protein - Association to stress response unknown.	S7
Bradi1g33690	Uncharacterized protein - Association to stress response unknown.	S7
Bradi1g07120	Putative S-adenosyl-L-methionine-dependent methyltransferase - Association to stress response unknown.	L٧

166 conserved throughout the evolution of Pooideae (Table 1). Several of these shared cold 167 responsive genes belonged to families known to be involved in cold stress or other abiotic stress 168 responses in other plant species. The most common type of response was short-term up

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae





- regulation, indicating that stress response, as opposed to long-term acclimation response, ispotentially more conserved.
- 171 Identified cold response genes confirmed previous findings

We compared the cold response genes from our data to a compilation of *H. vulgare* genes shown to be responsive to low temperature in several previous microarray studies, subsequently referred to as the Greenup genes (table S10 in [38]). We could map 33 of these 55 genes to unique OGs, of which 11 were HCOGs. We observed significant similarity in cold response between the 33 Greenup genes and the short-term cold response observed in our data (Fig. 3); for all five species (p < 0.05, see Methods). However, this similarity was noticeably larger in *H. vulgare* than in the other four species. This comparison showed that our transcriptome data was consistent with



Figure 4. Gene Ontology enrichment and positive selection in branch specific cold responsive genes. (a) Gene ontology enrichment analysis of high confidence ortholog groups (HCOG) that were differentially expressed (DEGs) in all species (PB), only in species after N. stricta split off (ES) or only in B. distachyon and H. vulgare (LS) (* P < 0.05, ** P < 0.01, *** P < 0.005, Fisher's exact test). Both the number of annotated genes and the number of annotations were indicated for each set of branch specific DEGs. (b) Positive selection at different stages in Pooideae evolution. The circles represent the high confidence ortholog groups that were tested for positive selection at each split (see Methods for the criteria). The inner blue circle represented HCOGs with branch specific differential expression (i.e. with genes that were cold responsive exclusively in the species under the respective branch) while the outer circle represented all other HCOGs. The purple and red pie-slices represented the proportions of HCOGs with positive selection (P < 0.05). The P-value indicated the overrepresentation of positive selection among the branch specific DEGs (Hypergeometric test).

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

previous findings in *H. vulgare*, and that cold response genes identified in *H. vulgare* exhibits
some cold response in other Pooideae.

181 Photosynthesis was down-regulated under cold stress

182 To identify biological processes that evolved regulation during different stages of Pooideae 183 evolution, we targeted gene sets that were exclusively differentially expressed in all species 184 within a clade in the phylogentic tree (i.e. branch specific DEGs), and tested these for enrichment 185 of Gene Ontology (GO) biological process annotations (Fig. 4a). For the genes that were 186 differentially expressed in all our species (Pooideae base [PB] in Fig 4b), we found enrichments 187 for annotations related to response to abiotic stimulus, photosynthesis and metabolism. Dividing 188 the branch specific DEGs into up- or down-regulated genes revealed up-regulation of signal 189 transduction (two pseudo response regulators and diacylglycerol kinase 2 (DGK2)) and abiotic 190 stimulus (Gigantea, LEA-14, DnaJ and DGK2), and down-regulation of photosynthesis and 191 metabolism. For the genes that were exclusively differentially expressed in all species except N. 192 stricta (early split [ES] in Fig. 4b), down-regulated genes were again enriched for GO 193 annotations related to metabolism and photosynthesis.

194 Cold response genes were associated with positive selection on amino acid content

For each HCOG, we tested for positive selection in coding sequences at each of the internal branches of the species tree. The tests were only performed on the branches where the gene tree topology was compatible with the species tree topology (see Methods). 16-18% of the HCOGs showed significant signs of positive selection (P < 0.05) depending on the branch (Fig. 4b). Next, we tested for overrepresentation of positive selection among the branch specific DEGs. There was a tendency that gain of cold response was associated with positive selection at the early split

201 (ES) and late split (LS) branches (P = 0.077 and P = 0.072, respectively) (Fig. 4b).

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

202 **Discussion**

203 The ecological success of the Pooideae subfamily in the northern temperate regions must have 204 critically relied on adaptation to colder temperatures. However, it is unclear how this adaptation 205 evolved within Pooideae. To test whether molecular responses to cold are conserved in the 206 Pooideae subfamily, we applied RNA-seq to identify short- and long-term cold responsive genes 207 in five Pooideae species ranging from early diverging lineages to core Pooideae species. Since 208 three of the species lacked reference genomes, we employed a *de novo* assembly pipeline to 209 reconstruct the transcriptomes and showed that this pipeline could recover a set of *H. vulgare* 210 genes previously identified as cold responsive (Fig. 3). In order to compare the five 211 transcriptomes, we compiled a set of 8633 high confidence ortholog groups with resolved gene 212 tree topologies. Gene expression clustering based on these ortholog groups arranged samples 213 according to replicates, then time points and finally species, indicating that cold response was the 214 primary signal in the data and confirming the soundness of the approach (Fig. 2a).

215 *Lineage specific adaptations to cold climates*

216 A substantial portion of the individual Pooideae transcriptomes responded to cold (1000-3000 217 genes), however, only a small number of genes responded to cold in all the investigated species 218 (83 genes, Fig. 2d). Even fewer genes responded similarly to cold in all species (e.g. short-term 219 up-regulation, 16 genes, Table 1) and these shared cold response genes primarily included 220 general abiotic stress genes clearly not representative of all the different molecular pathways 221 constituting a fully operational cold response program. We also observed low correlations in 222 expression fold changes between species, a result that was independent of our ability to correctly 223 classify genes as differentially expressed. All these results were based on high confidence 224 ortholog groups that excluded complex families with duplication events shared by two or more 225 species. Since many of the previously described H. vulgare cold responsive genes belonged to 226 such complex families, we could have underestimated the number of shared cold responsive 227 genes. However, we specifically investigated the regulation of these previously described genes 228 using all ortholog groups, and again found that few genes displayed shared cold response across 229 all species (Fig. 3), thus confirming our conclusion that cold response in Pooideae is largely 230 species specific. Taken together, our findings indicated that the most recent common ancestor of 231 the Pooideae possessed no, or only a limited, response to cold, and, consequently, that our data

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

appears more consistent with the lineage specific hypothesis of Pooideae cold adaptation than theancestral hypothesis.

234 The drastic cold stress during the E-O transition was likely an important cause for the evolution 235 of cold adaptation in Pooideae. Previous studies have shown that many temperate plant lineages 236 emerged during the E-O transition [25] and that the expansion of well-known cold responsive 237 gene families in Pooideae coincided with this transition [15, 26]. From the dated phylogeny (Fig. 238 1a) as well as from earlier studies of the Pooideae phylogeny [2, 28], it was clear that all major 239 Pooidaee lineages, including the core Pooideae, had emerged by the late Eocene. Hence, the five 240 lineages studied here experienced the E-O transition as individual lineages (Fig. 1c). 241 Furthermore, we found that closely related species did not share a higher fraction of cold 242 responsive genes than more distantly related species (no phylogenetic pattern, Fig. 2b-d). The 243 observation that the five Pooideae lineages emerged during a relatively warm period before the 244 E-O transition, and the finding that these species harbored high numbers of species specific cold 245 responsive genes with no phylogenetic pattern, together suggested that most of the cold response 246 in Pooideae lineages evolved in parallel during the last 40 M years. During this period, 247 temperatures were constantly decreasing and dramatic cooling events took place, such as the E-O 248 transition and the current Quaternary Ice Age.

249 Our results suggested that the Pooideae lineages evolved cold response in parallel using, to a 250 large degree, unrelated genes. This implies that different genes can be co-opted into the 251 functional cold response of the Pooideae. It is worth noticing, however, that although we 252 observed many species specific cold response genes, all species pairs displayed a statistically 253 significant correlation in cold response across all HCOGs (Fig. 2b) and a statistically 254 significantly overlap in cold responsive genes (Fig. 2c). This may reflect that some genes code 255 for proteins with biochemical functions more suited to be recruited for cold response than others 256 [39, 40], and that different species thus have ended up co-opting orthologous genes into their 257 cold response program more often than expected by chance.

258 An adaptive potential in the Pooideae ancestor

Multiple independent origins of cold adaptation raise the question whether connecting traits exists in the evolutionary history of the Pooideae that can explain why the Pooideae lineages were able to shift to the temperate biome. The transcripts that were cold responsive across all

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

262 five species (Table 1) represented genes that might have gained cold responsiveness in the 263 Pooideae most recent common ancestor and contributed to increase the potential of Pooideae 264 lineages to adapt to a cold temperate climate. Several of these conserved genes were known to be 265 involved in abiotic stresses in other plants such as drought or other osmotic stress, which share 266 some physiological effects experienced during freezing. Co-option of such genes into a cold-267 responsive pathway might have been the key to acquire cold tolerance. In fact, other studies have 268 implied that drought tolerance might have facilitated the shift to temperate biome [26, 41, 42]. 269 Interestingly, most of the conserved genes were short-term cold responsive (Table 1) and this 270 observation strengthened the hypothesis that existing stress genes might have been the first to be 271 co-opted into the cold response program. Also, three of the conserved cold responsive genes 272 (GIGANTEA, PRR95 and AtPRR3-like) were associated with the circadian clock that is known 273 to be affected by cold [43-45]. This might suggest that clock genes have had an important 274 function in the Pooideae cold adaptation, for example by acting as a signal for initiating the cold 275 defense. More generally, transcripts involved in photosynthesis and response to abiotic stimuli 276 were significantly enriched among the genes with cold response in all species (Fig. 4a). An 277 expanded stress responsiveness towards cold stress and the ability to down-regulate the 278 photosynthetic machinery during cold temperatures to prevent photoinhibition might have 279 existed in the early evolution of Pooideae. In conclusion, the conserved stress response genes 280 discussed here may have represented a fitness advantage for the Pooideae ancestor in the newly 281 emerging environment with incidents of mild frost, allowing time to evolve the more complex 282 physiological adaptations required to endure the temperate climate with strong seasonality and 283 cold winters that emerged following the E-O transition [23]. Consistent with this, Schubert et al. 284 (unpublished) showed that the fructan synthesis and ice recrystallization inhibition protein gene 285 families known to be involved in cold acclimation in core Pooideae species [10] evolved around 286 the E-O split, whereas also earlier evolving Pooideae species show capacity to cold acclimate.

287 *Evolution of coding and regulatory sequences*

The molecular mechanisms behind adaptive evolution are still poorly understood, although it is now indisputably established that novel gene regulation plays a crucial role [46]. The evolution of gene regulation proceeds by altering non-coding regulatory sequences in the genome, such as (cis-) regulatory elements [47], and has the potential to evolve faster than protein sequence and

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

292 function. The high number of species specific cold response genes observed in this study is thus 293 most consistent with the recruitment of genes with existing cold tolerance functions by means of 294 regulatory evolution. However, previous studies have also pointed to the evolution of coding 295 sequences [27] as underlying the acquisition of cold tolerance in Pooideae. To investigate 296 possible coding evolution, we tested for the enrichment of positive selection among branch 297 specific cold responsive genes (Fig. 4b). Although not statistically significant, there was a 298 tendency for positive selection in genes gaining cold response in a period of gradual cooling 299 preceding the E-O event. Thus, we saw evidence of both coding and regulatory evolution playing 300 a role in cold adaptation in Pooideae, and that these processes may have interacted. Finally, gene 301 family expansion has previously been implied in cold adaptation in Pooideae [15, 26]. As 302 previously discussed, the conservative filtering of ortholog groups employed in this study 303 removed complex gene families containing duplication events shared by two or more species. 304 Interestingly, out of the 33 previously described *H. vulgare* cold responsive genes (Fig. 3), as 305 many as 22 were not included in the high confidence ortholog groups, the main reason being that 306 they belonged to gene families with duplications. This observation thus confirms that duplication 307 events are a relatively common feature of cold adaptation. Although *de novo* assembly of 308 transcriptomes from short-read RNA-Seq data is a powerful tool that has vastly expanded the 309 number of target species for conducting transcriptomic analysis, the approach has limited power 310 to distinguish highly similar transcripts such as paralogs. Further insight into the role of 311 duplication events in Pooideae cold adaptation would therefore benefit immensely from 312 additional reference genomes.

313 Conclusion

314 Here we investigated the cold response of five Pooideae species, ranging from early diverging 315 lineages to core Pooideae species, to elucidate evolution of adaptation to cold temperate regions. 316 We primarily observed species specific cold response that seems to have evolved chiefly after 317 the B. distachyon lineage and the core Pooideae diverged, possible initiated by the drastic 318 temperature drop during the E-O transition. However, we do also see signs of conserved 319 response that potentially represents a shared potential for cold adaptation that explain the success 320 of Pooideae in temperate regions. This included several general stress genes with conserved 321 short-term response to cold as well as the conserved ability to down-regulate the photosynthetic

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

322 machinery during cold temperatures. Taken together, our observations are consistent with a

323 scenario where many of the biochemical functions needed for cold response were present in the

- 324 Pooideae common ancestor, and where different Pooideae lineages have assembled, in parallel,
- 325 different overlapping subsets of these genes into fully functional cold response programs through
- 326 the relatively rapid process of regulatory evolution.

327 Methods

328 Plant material, sampling and sequencing

329 To address our hypothesis, we selected five species to cover the phylogenetic spread of 330 Pooideae. The selected species also represent major, species rich lineages or clades in the 331 Pooideae subfamily, or belong to very early diverging lineages [5]. Seeds were collected either in 332 nature: Nardus stricta (collected in Romania, [46.69098, 22.58302], July 2012) and Melica nutans (collected in Germany, [50.70708, 11.23838], June 2012); or acquired from germplasm 333 334 collections: Stipa lagascae (PI 250751, U.S. National Plant Germplasm System (U.S.-NPGS) via 335 Germplasm Resources Information Network [GRIN]), Brachypodium distachyon (line 'Bd1-1', 336 W6 46201, U.S.-NPGS via GRIN) and *Hordeum vulgare* (line 'Igri', provided by Prof. Åsmund 337 Bjørnstad, Department of Plant Sciences, Norwegian University of Life Sciences, Norway). 338 Seeds were germinated and initially grown in a greenhouse at a neutral day length (12 hours of 339 light), 17°C and a minimum artificial light intensity of 150 µmol/m2s. Because the seedlings of 340 the phylogenetically diverse species grew at different rates, the sampling was based on 341 developmental stages rather than time. Plants were grown until three to four leaves had emerged 342 for M. nutans, S. lagascae, B. distachyon and H. vulgare, or six to seven leaves for N. stricta 343 (which is a cushion forming grass that produces many small leaves compared to its overall plant 344 size). Depending on the species, this process took one (*H. vulgare*), three (*B. distachvon* and *S.* 345 lagascae), six (M. nutans) or eight (N. stricta) weeks from the time of sowing. Subsequently, 346 plants were randomized and distributed to two cold chambers with short day (8 hours of light), 347 6°C and a light intensity of 50 μmol/m2s. Leaf material for RNA isolation was collected i) in the 348 afternoon (8 hours of light) before cold treatment (D0) and 8 hours after cold treatment (D1) and 349 ii) in the morning (at lights on) before cold treatment (W0), 4 weeks after cold treatment (W4) 350 and 9 weeks after cold treatment (W9) (Fig. 1d). Flash frozen leaves were individually

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

351 homogenized using a TissueLyser (Oiagen Retsch) and total RNA was isolated (from each leaf) 352 using RNeasy Plant Mini Kit (Qiagen) following the manufacturer's instructions. The purity and 353 integrity of total RNA extracts was determined using a NanoDrop 8000 UV-Vis 354 Spectrophotometer (Thermo Scientific) and 2100 Bioanalyzer (Agilent), respectively. For each 355 time point, RNA extracts from five leaves sampled from five different plants were pooled and 356 sequenced as a single sample. In addition, replicates from single individual leaves were 357 sequenced for selected timepoints (see Table S1 and "Differential expression" below). Two time 358 points lacked expression values: W9 in B. distachyon (RNA integrity was insufficient for RNA 359 sequencing) and W0 in S. lagascae (insufficient supply of plant material). Samples were sent to 360 the Norwegian Sequencing Centre, where strand-specific cDNA libraries were prepared and 361 sequenced (paired-end) on an Illumina HiSeq 2000 system. The raw reads are available in the 362 ArrayExpress database (www.ebi.ac.uk/arrayexpress) under accession number E-MTAB-5300.

363 *Transcriptome assembly and ortholog inference*

364 Using Trimmomatic v0.32 [48], all reads were trimmed to a length of 120 bp, Illumina TruSeq 365 adapters were removed from the raw reads, low quality bases trimmed using a sliding window of 366 40 bp and an average quality cut-off of 15 and reads below a minimum length of 36 bp were 367 discarded. Read quality was controlled using fastqc v0.11.2. For each species, transcripts were 368 assembled *de novo* with Trinity v2.0.6 [49] (strand specific option, otherwise default parameters) 369 using reads from all samples. Coding sequences (CDS) were identified using TransDecoder 370 rel16JAN2014 [50]. Where Trinity reported multiple isoforms, only the longest CDS was 371 retained. Ortholog groups (OGs) were constructed from the five *de novo* transcriptomes and 372 public reference transcriptomes of H. vulgare (barley HighConf genes MIPS 23Mar12), B. 373 distachyon (brachypodium v1.2), O. sativa (rap2), Z. mays (ZmB73 5a WGS), S. bicolor 374 (sorghum 1.4) and L. perenne (GenBank TSA accession GAYX01000000) using OrthoMCL 375 v2.0.9 [51]. All reference sequences except L. perenne were downloaded from 376 http://pgsb.helmholtz-muenchen.de/plant/plantsdb.jsp. A summary of the results is provided in 377 Table S1.

378 *High confidence ortholog groups*

To compare gene expression across Pooideae, we identified ortholog groups containing one gene from each species that all descended from a single gene in the Pooideae ancestor. As the ortholog

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

381 groups (OGs) inferred using orthoMCL sometimes cluster more distantly related homologs as 382 well as include both paraphyletic and monophyletic paralogs, we further refined the OGs by 383 phylogenetic analysis. Several approaches to phylogenetic refinement has been proposed 384 previously (see e.g. [52]). Here we first aligned protein sequences within each OG using mafft 385 v7.130 [53] and converted to codon alignments using pal2nal v14 [54]. Gene trees were then constructed from the codon alignments using Phangorn v1.99.14 [55] (maximum likelihood 386 387 GTR+I+G). Trees with apparent duplication events before the most recent common ancestor of 388 the included species were split into several trees. This was accomplished by identifying in-group 389 (Pooideae) and out-group (Z. mays, S. bicolor and O. sativa) clades in each tree, and then 390 splitting the trees so that each resulting sub-tree contained a single out-group and a single in-391 group clade. Finally, we only retained the trees were all species in the tree formed one clade each 392 (i.e. only monophyletic paralogs), B. distachyon and H. vulgare formed a clade and at least three 393 of the five studied species were included. These trees constituted the high confidence ortholog 394 groups (HCOGs).

395 Species tree

396 Ortholog groups with a single ortholog from each of the five *de novo* Pooideae species and O. 397 sativa (after splitting the trees, see "High confidence ortholog groups") were used to infer dated 398 gene trees. To this end, BEAST v1.7.5 [56] was run with an HKY + Γ nucleotide substitution 399 model using an uncorrelated lognormal relaxed clock model. A Yule process (birth only) was 400 used as prior for the tree and the monophyly of the Pooideae was constrained. Prior estimates for 401 the Oryza-Pooideae (53 Mya [SD 3.6 My], [37]) and Brachypodium-Hordeum (44.4 Mya [SD 402 3.53 My], [28]) divergence times were used to define normally distributed age priors for the 403 respective nodes in the topology. MCMC analyses were run for 10 million generations and 404 parameters were sampled every 10.000 generation. For each gene tree analysis, the first 10 405 percent of the estimated trees were discarded and the remaining trees were summarized to a 406 maximum clade credibility (MCC) tree using TreeAnnotator v1.7.5. The topology of the species 407 tree was equal to the most common topology among the 3914 MCC trees, with internal node 408 ages set equal to the mean of the corresponding node age distributions of the MCC gene trees.

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

409 Differential expression

410 Reads were mapped to the *de novo* transcriptomes using bowtie v1.1.2 [57], and read counts 411 were calculated with RSEM v1.2.9 [58]. In HCOGs, read counts of paralogs were summed 412 (analogous to so called monophyly masking [59]) and missing orthologs were assumed to not be expressed (i.e. read counts equal to zero). To identify conserved and diverged cold response 413 414 across species, we probed each HCOG for differentially expressed genes (DEGs). Specifically, 415 DEGs were identified using DESeq2 v1.6.3 [60] with a model that combined the species factor 416 and the timepoint factor (with timepoints W4/9 as a single level). Pooled samples provided robust estimates of the mean expression in each time point. To also obtain robust estimates of the 417 418 variance, the model assumed common variance across all timepoints and species within each 419 HCOG, thus taking advantage of both biological replicates available for individual time points 420 within species and the replication provided by analysing several species. For each species, we 421 tested the expression difference between D0 and D1 (short-term response) and the difference 422 between W0 and W4/9 (long-term response) (Fig. 1d). B. distachyon lacked the W9 samples and 423 long-term response was therefore based on W4 only. S. lagascae lacked the W0 sample and 424 long-term response was therefore calculated based on D0. As a result, the observed diurnal effect 425 (Fig. 2a) might have resulted in more unreliable estimates of the long term cold response in S. 426 lagascae since for this species the afternoon sample (D0) was used to replace the missing 427 morning sample (W0). Genes with a false discovery rate (FDR) adjusted p-value < 0.05 and a 428 fold change > 2 were classified as differentially expressed.

429 Sample clustering

430 Sample clustering was based on read counts normalized using the variance-stabilizing 431 transformation (VST) implemented in DESeq2 (these VST-values are essentially log 432 transformed). HCOGs that lacked orthologs from any of the five species, or that contained 433 orthologs with low expression (VST < 3), were removed, resulting in 4981 HCOGs used for the 434 clustering. To highlight the effect of the cold treatment over the effect of absolute expression 435 differences between species, the expression values were normalised per gene and species: First, 436 one expression value was obtained per timepoint per gene by taking the mean of the replicates. 437 Then, these expression values were centered by subtracting the mean expression of all timepoint. 438 Distances between all pairs of samples were calculated as the sum of absolute expression

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

difference between orthologs in the 4981 HCOGs (i.e. manhattan distance). The tree wasgenerated using neighbor-joining [61].

441 *Comparison with known cold responsive genes*

442 A set of *H. vulgare* genes independently identified as cold responsive were acquired from 443 supplementary table S10 in [38]. These genes were found to be responsive to cold in three 444 independent experiments with Plexdb accessions BB64 [62], BB81 (no publication) and BB94 445 [38]. The probesets of the Affymetrix Barley1 GeneChip microarray used in these studies were 446 blasted (blastx) against all protein sequences in our OGs. Each probe was assigned to the OG 447 with the best match in the *H. vulgare* reference. If several probes were assigned to the same OG, 448 only the probe with the best hit was retained. Correspondingly, if a probe matched several 449 paralogs within the same OG, only the best match was retained. DESeq2 was used to identify 450 short-term response DEGs for all transcripts in all OGs (i.e. this analysis was not restricted to the 451 HCOGs), and these were compared to DEGs from [38]. The statistical significance of the overlap 452 between our results and those reported in [38] was assessed for each species by counting the 453 number of genes that had the same response (up- or down-regulated DEGs) and comparing that 454 to a null distribution. The null distribution was obtained from equivalent counts obtained from 455 100 000 trials where genes were randomly selected from all expressed genes (mean read count > 456 10) with an ortholog in *H. vulgare*.

457 *Gene ontology enrichment tests*

Gene Ontology (GO) annotations for *B. distachyon* were downloaded from Ensembl Plants Biomart and assigned to the HCOGs. The TopGO v2.18.0 R package [63] was used to calculate statistically significant enrichments (Fisher's exact test, p < 0.05) of GO biological process annotations restricted to GO plant slim in each set of branch specific DEGs using all annotated HCOGs as the background. Branch specific DEGs were those genes that were exclusively differentially expressed in all species within a clade in the phylogenetic tree.

464 *Positive selection tests*

Each of the HCOGs were tested for positive selection using the branch-site model in codeml, which is part of PAML v4.7 [64]. We only tested branches for positive selection in HCOGs meeting the following criteria: (i) The tested branch had to be an internal branch also in the gene

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

tree (i.e. there was at least two species below the branch). (ii) The species below and above the tested branch in the gene tree had to be the same as in the species tree or a subset thereof. (iii) The first species to split off under the branch had to be the same as in the species tree (for the early split, either *S. lagascae* or *M. nutans* was allowed). We then used the Hypergeometric test to identify statistically significant overrepresentation of positive selection among branch specific DEGs (see "Gene ontology enrichment tests") at the Pooideae base (PB), the early split (ES) and the late split (LS) branches.

475 **Declarations**

- 476 *Ethics approval and consent to participate*
- 477 Not applicable.
- 478 *Consent for publication*
- 479 Not applicable.
- 480 Availability of data and material
- 481 The raw reads, the assembled transcripts and the raw read counts are available in the
- 482 ArrayExpress database (www.ebi.ac.uk/arrayexpress) under accession number E-MTAB-5300.
- 483 *Competing interests*
- 484 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.
- 485 Funding
- 486 The research was funded by grants from the Nansen Foundation to SF and the TVERRforsk

487 program at the Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU) to SF, TRH and SRS. This work

488 was part of the PhD projects of MS and LG funded by NMBU.

489 *Authors' contributions*

All authors designed the experiment. M.S. performed the growth experiments, sampled and prepared RNA for sequencing, helped designing the data analysis pipeline, contributed to the positive selection analysis and performed the phylogenetic analyses. L.G. developed, implemented and conducted the data analysis. All authors interpreted the results. M.S. and L.G. wrote the manuscript with input from S.F., T.R.H., and S.R.S.

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

495 Acknowledgements

496 We thank Åsmund Bjørnstad and USDA-NPGS GRIN for providing seeds of *H. vulgare*, and *B.*

497 *distachyon* and *S. lagascae*, respectively. For technical assistance handling plants during growth

- 498 experiments we thank Øyvind Jørgensen. We are grateful to Erica Leder, Thomas Marcussen,
- 499 Ursula Brandes and Camilla Lorange Lindberg for helpful comments on earlier versions of this
- 500 manuscript.

501 **References**

- 502 1. Hartley W. Studies on Origin, Evolution, and Distribution of Gramineae. 5. The Subfamily
 503 Festucoideae. Aust J Bot. 1973;21:201–34.
- Bouchenak-Khelladi Y, Verboom AG, Savolainen V, Hodkinson TR. Biogeography of the
 grasses (Poaceae): a phylogenetic approach to reveal evolutionary history in geographical space
 and geological time. Bot J Linn Soc. 2010;162:543–57.
- 507 3. Strömberg CAE. Evolution of Grasses and Grassland Ecosystems. Annu Rev Earth Planet Sci.
 508 2011;39:517–44.
- 4. Edwards EJ, Smith SA. Phylogenetic Analyses Reveal the Shady History of C₄ Grasses. Proc
 Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2010;107:2532–7.
- 511 5. Soreng RJ, Peterson PM, Romaschenko K, Davidse G, Zuloaga FO, Judziewicz EJ, et al. A
- 512 worldwide phylogenetic classification of the Poaceae (Gramineae). J Syst Evol. 2015;53:117–37.
- 513 6. Tsvetanov S, Atanassov A, Nakamura C. Gold Responsive Gene/Protein Families and
 514 Cold/Freezing Tolerance in Cereals. Biotechnol Biotechnol Equip. 2000;14:3–11.
- 515 7. Galiba G, Vágújfalvi A, Li C, Soltész A, Dubcovsky J. Regulatory genes involved in the 516 determination of frost tolerance in temperate cereals. Plant Sci. 2009;176:12–9.
- 517 8. Thomashow MF. Molecular Basis of Plant Cold Acclimation: Insights Gained from Studying
- the CBF Cold Response Pathway. Plant Physiol. 2010;154:571–7.
- 519 9. Kosová K, Vítámvás P, Prášil IT. Expression of dehydrins in wheat and barley under different
 520 temperatures. Plant Sci. 2011;180:46–52.
- 521 10. Sandve SR, Kosmala A, Rudi H, Fjellheim S, Rapacz M, Yamada T, et al. Molecular

- 522 mechanisms underlying frost tolerance in perennial grasses adapted to cold climates. Plant Sci.
- 523 2011;180:69–77.
- 524 11. Tondelli A, Francia E, Barabaschi D, Pasquariello M, Pecchioni N. Inside the CBF locus in
- 525 Poaceae. Plant Sci. 2011;180:39–45.
- 526 12. Crosatti C, Rizza F, Badeck FW, Mazzucotelli E, Cattivelli L. Harden the chloroplast to
- 527 protect the plant. Physiol Plant. 2013;147:55–63.
- 528 13. Preston JC, Sandve SR. Adaptation to seasonality and the winter freeze. Front Plant Sci.529 2013;4 June:167.
- 530 14. Davis JI, Soreng RJ. Phylogenetic Structure in the Grass Family (Poaceae) as Inferred from
- 531 Chloroplast DNA Restriction Site Variation. Am J Bot. 1993;80:1444–54.
- 532 15. Li C, Rudi H, Stockinger EJ, Cheng H, Cao M, Fox SE, et al. Comparative analyses reveal
- 533 potential uses of *Brachypodium distachyon* as a model for cold stress responses in temperate
- 534 grasses. BMC Plant Biol. 2012;12:65.
- 535 16. Priest HD, Fox SE, Rowley ER, Murray JR, Michael TP, Mockler TC, et al. Analysis of
- 536 Global Gene Expression in Brachypodium distachyon Reveals Extensive Network Plasticity in
- 537 Response to Abiotic Stress. PLoS One. 2014;9:e87499.
- 538 17. Colton-Gagnon K, Ali-Benali MA, Mayer BF, Dionne R, Bertrand A, Do Carmo S, et al.
- 539 Comparative analysis of the cold acclimation and freezing tolerance capacities of seven diploid
- 540 *Brachypodium distachyon* accessions. Ann Bot. 2014;113:681–93.
- 541 18. Zachos J, Pagani M, Sloan L, Thomas E, Billups K. Trends, rhythms, and aberrations in
 542 global climate 65 Ma to present. Science. 2001;292:686–93.
- 543 19. Eberle JJ, Greenwood DR. Life at the top of the greenhouse Eocene world--A review of the 544 Eocene flora and vertebrate fauna from Canada's High Arctic. Geol Soc Am Bull. 2011;124:3–
- 545 23.
- 546 20. Schubert BA, Jahren AH, Eberle JJ, Sternberg LSL, Eberth DA. A summertime rainy season
 547 in the Arctic forests of the Eocene. Geology. 2012;40:523–6.
- 548 21. Pross J, Contreras L, Bijl PK, Greenwood DR, Bohaty SM, Schouten S, et al. Persistent near-
- tropical warmth on the Antarctic continent during the early Eocene epoch. Nature. 2012;488:73–

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

550 7.

- 551 22. Mudelsee M, Bickert T, Lear CH, Lohmann G. Cenozoic climate changes: A review based 552 on time series analysis of marine benthic δ 18 O records. Rev Geophys. 2014;52:333–74.
- 553 23. Eldrett JS, Greenwood DR, Harding IC, Huber M. Increased seasonality through the Eocene
- to Oligocene transition in northern high latitudes. Nature. 2009;459:969–73.
- 555 24. Hren MT, Sheldon ND, Grimes ST, Collinson ME, Hooker JJ, Bugler M, et al. Terrestrial
 556 cooling in Northern Europe during the eocene-oligocene transition. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A.
 557 2013;110:7562–7.
- 558 25. Kerkhoff AJ, Moriarty PE, Weiser MD. The latitudinal species richness gradient in New
- 559 World woody angiosperms is consistent with the tropical conservatism hypothesis. Proc Natl
- 560 Acad Sci U S A. 2014;111:8125–30.
- 26. Sandve SR, Fjellheim S. Did gene family expansions during the Eocene-Oligocene boundary
 climate cooling play a role in Pooideae adaptation to cool climates? Mol Biol. 2010;19:2075–88.
- 563 27. Vigeland MD, Spannagl M, Asp T, Paina C, Rudi H, Rognli O-A, et al. Evidence for
 564 adaptive evolution of low-temperature stress response genes in a Pooideae grass ancestor. New
 565 Phytol. 2013;199:1060–8.
- 566 28. Marcussen T, Sandve SR, Heier L, Spannagl M, Pfeifer M, Jakobsen KS, et al. Ancient
 567 hybridizations among the ancestral genomes of bread wheat. Science. 2014;345:1250092.
- 568 29. Donoghue MJ. Colloquium paper: a phylogenetic perspective on the distribution of plant
 569 diversity. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2008; Suppl 1:11549–55.
- 570 30. Thomashow MF. Plant Cold Acclimation: Freezing Tolerance Genes and Regulatory
 571 Mechanisms. Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol. 1999;50:571–99.
- 572 31. Janská A, Maršík P, Zelenková S, Ovesná J. Cold stress and acclimation what is important
 573 for metabolic adjustment? Plant Biol. 2010;12:395–405.
- 574 32. Carvallo MA, Pino M-T, Jeknic Z, Zou C, Doherty CJ, Shiu S-H, et al. A comparison of the
- 575 low temperature transcriptomes and CBF regulons of three plant species that differ in freezing
- 576 tolerance: Solanum commersonii, Solanum tuberosum, and Arabidopsis thaliana. J Exp Bot.
- 577 2011;62:3807–19.

- 578 33. Zhang T, Zhao X, Wang W, Pan Y, Huang L, Liu X, et al. Comparative transcriptome
- 579 profiling of chilling stress responsiveness in two contrasting rice genotypes. PLoS One. 580 2012;7:e43274.
- 581 34. Lindlöf A, Chawade A, Sikora P, Olsson O. Comparative Transcriptomics of Sijung and
- 582 Jumli Marshi Rice during Early Chilling Stress Imply Multiple Protective Mechanisms. PLoS
- 583 One. 2015;10:e0125385.
- 584 35. Yang Y-W, Chen H-C, Jen W-F, Liu L-Y, Chang M-C. Comparative Transcriptome Analysis 585 of Shoots and Roots of TNG67 and TCN1 Rice Seedlings under Cold Stress and Following 586 Subsequent Recovery: Insights into Metabolic Pathways, Phytohormones, and Transcription 587
- Factors. PLoS One. 2015;10:e0131391.
- 588 36. Abeynayake SW, Byrne S, Nagy I, Jonavičienė K, Etzerodt TP, Boelt B, et al. Changes in
- 589 Lolium perenne transcriptome during cold acclimation in two genotypes adapted to different 590 climatic conditions. BMC Plant Biol. 2015;15:250.
- 591 37. Christin P-A, Spriggs E, Osborne CP, Stromberg CAE, Salamin N, Edwards EJ. Molecular 592 Dating, Evolutionary Rates, and the Age of the Grasses. Syst Biol. 2014;63:153–65.
- 593 38. Greenup AG, Sharyar S, Oliver SN, Walford SA, Millar AA, Trevaskis B. Transcriptome 594 Analysis of the Vernalization Response in Barley (Hordeum vulgare) Seedlings. PLoS One. 595 2011;6:e17900.
- 596 39. Christin P-A, Boxall SF, Gregory R, Edwards EJ, Hartwell J, Osborne CP. Parallel 597 Recruitment of Multiple Genes into C4 Photosynthesis. Genome Biol Evol. 2013;5:2174–87.
- 598 40. Christin P-A, Arakaki M, Osborne CP, Edwards EJ. Genetic Enablers Underlying the 599 Clustered Evolutionary Origins of C4 Photosynthesis in Angiosperms. Mol Biol Evol. 600 2015;32:846-58.
- 601 41. Kellogg EA. Evolutionary History of the Grasses. Plant Physiol. 2001;125:1198–205.
- 602 42. Schardl CL, Craven KD, Speakman S, Stromberg A, Lindstrom A, Yoshida R. A novel test 603 for host-symbiont codivergence indicates ancient origin of fungal endophytes in grasses. Syst 604 Biol. 2008;57:483-98.
- 605 43. Bieniawska Z, Espinoza C, Schlereth A, Sulpice R, Hincha DK, Hannah MA. Disruption of

- 606 the Arabidopsis circadian clock is responsible for extensive variation in the cold-responsive
- 607 transcriptome. Plant Physiol. 2008;147:263–79.
- 608 44. Nakamichi N, Kiba T, Henriques R, Mizuno T, Chua NH, Sakakibara H. PSEUDO-
- 609 RESPONSE REGULATORS 9, 7, and 5 Are Transcriptional Repressors in the Arabidopsis
- 610 Circadian Clock. Plant Cell. 2010;22:594–605.
- 611 45. Johansson M, Ramos-Sánchez JM, Conde D, Ibáñez C, Takata N, Allona I, et al. Role of the
- 612 Circadian Clock in Cold Acclimation and Winter Dormancy in Perennial Plants. In: Advances in
- 613 Plant Dormancy. Cham: Springer International Publishing; 2015. p. 51–74.
- 614 46. Romero IG, Ruvinsky I, Gilad Y. Comparative studies of gene expression and the evolution
- of gene regulation. Nat Rev Genet. 2012;13:505–16.
- 616 47. Wittkopp PJ, Kalay G. Cis-regulatory elements: molecular mechanisms and evolutionary
- 617 processes underlying divergence. Nat Rev Genet. 2012;13:59–69.
- 48. Bolger AM, Lohse M, Usadel B. Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina sequencedata. Bioinformatics. 2014;:btu170.
- 49. Grabherr MG, Haas BJ, Yassour M, Levin JZ, Thompson DA, Amit I, et al. Full-length
 transcriptome assembly from RNA-Seq data without a reference genome. Nat Biotechnol.
 2011;29:644.
- 50. Haas BJ, Papanicolaou A, Yassour M, Grabherr M, Blood PD, Bowden J, et al. De novo
 transcript sequence reconstruction from RNA-seq using the Trinity platform for reference
 generation and analysis. Nat Protoc. 2013;8:1494–512.
- 51. Li L, Stoeckert CJ, Roos DS. OrthoMCL: identification of ortholog groups for eukaryotic
 genomes. Genome Res. 2003;13:2178–89.
- 52. Yang Y, Smith SA. Orthology inference in nonmodel organisms using transcriptomes and
 low-coverage genomes: improving accuracy and matrix occupancy for phylogenomics. Mol Biol
 Evol. 2014;31:3081–92.
- 53. Katoh K, Standley DM. MAFFT Multiple Sequence Alignment Software Version 7:
 Improvements in Performance and Usability. Mol Biol Evol. 2013;30:772–80.
- 633 54. Suyama M, Torrents D, Bork P. PAL2NAL: robust conversion of protein sequence

- alignments into the corresponding codon alignments. Nucleic Acids Res. 2006;34 suppl2:W609–12.
- 636 55. Schliep KP. phangorn: phylogenetic analysis in R. Bioinformatics. 2011;27:592–3.
- 637 56. Drummond AJ, Rambaut A, Huelsenbeck J, Ronquist F, Beaumont M, Drummond A, et al.
- 638 BEAST: Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling trees. BMC Evol Biol. 2007;7:214.
- 639 57. Langmead B, Trapnell C, Pop M, Salzberg SL, Down T, Rakyan V, et al. Ultrafast and
- 640 memory-efficient alignment of short DNA sequences to the human genome. Genome Biol.641 2009;10:R25.
- 58. Li B, Dewey CN, Wang Z, Gerstein M, Snyder M, Katz Y, et al. RSEM: accurate transcript
- quantification from RNA-Seq data with or without a reference genome. BMC Bioinformatics.2011;12:323.
- 59. Smith SA, Wilson NG, Goetz FE, Feehery C, Andrade SCS, Rouse GW, et al. Resolving the
 evolutionary relationships of molluscs with phylogenomic tools. Nature. 2011;480:364–7.
- 647 60. Love MI, Huber W, Anders S, Lönnstedt I, Speed T, Robinson M, et al. Moderated
 648 estimation of fold change and dispersion for RNA-seq data with DESeq2. Genome Biol 2014
 649 1512. 2014;15:31–46.
- 650 61. Saitou N, Nei M. The neighbor-joining method: a new method for reconstructing 651 phylogenetic trees. Mol Biol Evol. 1987;4:406–25.
- 652 62. Svensson JT, Crosatti C, Campoli C, Bassi R, Stanca AM, Close TJ, et al. Transcriptome
 653 Analysis of Cold Acclimation in Barley Albina and Xantha Mutants. PLANT Physiol.
 654 2006;141:257–70.
- 655 63. Alexa A, Rahnenfuhrer J. topGO: Enrichment analysis for Gene Ontology. R package
 656 version 2.18.0. October. 2010.
- 657 64. Yang Z. PAML 4: Phylogenetic Analysis by Maximum Likelihood. Mol Biol Evol.
 658 2007;24:1586–91.
- 659 65. Yuan F, Yang H, Xue Y, Kong D, Ye R, Li C, et al. OSCA1 mediates osmotic-stress-evoked
- 660 Ca2+ increases vital for osmosensing in Arabidopsis. Nature. 2014;514:367–71.

- 661 66. Hou C, Tian W, Kleist T, He K, Garcia V, Bai F, et al. DUF221 proteins are a family of
- osmosensitive calcium-permeable cation channels conserved across eukaryotes. Cell Res.
 2014;24:632–5.
- 664 67. Li Y, Yuan F, Wen Z, Li Y, Wang F, Zhu T, et al. Genome-wide survey and expression
- analysis of the OSCA gene family in rice. BMC Plant Biol. 2015;15:261.
- 666 68. Day IS, Reddy VS, Shad Ali G, Reddy ASN. Analysis of EF-hand-containing proteins in
- 667 Arabidopsis. Genome Biol. 2002;3:RESEARCH0056.
- 668 69. Bose J, Pottosin II, Shabala SS, Palmgren MG, Shabala S. Calcium Efflux Systems in Stress
 669 Signaling and Adaptation in Plants. Front Plant Sci. 2011;2:85.
- 670 70. Yang Q-S, Gao J, He W-D, Dou T-X, Ding L-J, Wu J-H, et al. Comparative transcriptomics
- analysis reveals difference of key gene expression between banana and plantain in response to
- 672 cold stress. BMC Genomics. 2015;16:446.
- 673 71. Andrés F, Coupland G. The genetic basis of flowering responses to seasonal cues. Nat Rev674 Genet. 2012;13:627–39.
- 675 72. Cao S, Ye M, Jiang S. Involvement of GIGANTEA gene in the regulation of the cold stress
 676 response in Arabidopsis. Plant Cell Rep. 2005;24:683–90.
- 677 73. Xie Q, Lou P, Hermand V, Aman R, Park HJ, Yun D-J, et al. Allelic polymorphism of
- 678 GIGANTEA is responsible for naturally occurring variation in circadian period in Brassica rapa.
- 679 Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2015;112:3829–34.
- 680 74. Sobkowiak A, Jończyk M, Jarochowska E, Biecek P, Trzcinska-Danielewicz J, Leipner J, et
- al. Genome-wide transcriptomic analysis of response to low temperature reveals candidate genes
- determining divergent cold-sensitivity of maize inbred lines. Plant Mol Biol. 2014;85:317–31.
- 683 75. Murakami-Kojima M. The APRR3 Component of the Clock-Associated APRR1/TOC1
- 684 Quintet is Phosphorylated by a Novel Protein Kinase Belonging to the WNK Family, the Gene
- 685 for which is also Transcribed Rhythmically in Arabidopsis thaliana. Plant Cell Physiol. 686 2002;43:675–83.
- 687 76. Murakami M. Characterization of Circadian-Associated APRR3 Pseudo-Response Regulator
 688 Belonging to the APRR1/TOC1 Quintet in Arabidopsis thaliana. Plant Cell Physiol.

- 689 2004;45:645–50.
- 690 77. Wang Z-Y, Xiong L, Li W, Zhu J-K, Zhu J. The plant cuticle is required for osmotic stress
- 691 regulation of abscisic acid biosynthesis and osmotic stress tolerance in Arabidopsis. Plant Cell.
- 692 2011;23:1971–84.
- 693 78. Liu D, Wang L, Zhai H, Song X, He S, Liu Q. A novel α/β-hydrolase gene IbMas enhances
- salt tolerance in transgenic sweetpotato. PLoS One. 2014;9:e115128.
- 695 79. Guan W, Ferry N, Edwards MG, Bell HA, Othman H, Gatehouse JA, et al. Proteomic
 696 analysis shows that stress response proteins are significantly up-regulated in resistant diploid
 697 wheat (Triticum monococcum) in response to attack by the grain aphid (Sitobion avenae). Mol
 698 Breed. 2015;35:57.
- 699 80. Kimura M, Yamamoto YY, Seki M, Sakurai T, Sato M, Abe T, et al. Identification of
- Arabidopsis Genes Regulated by High Light-Stress Using cDNA Microarray¶. Photochem
 Photobiol. 2003;77:226–33.
- 81. Singh S, Cornilescu CC, Tyler RC, Cornilescu G, Tonelli M, Lee MS, et al. Solution
 structure of a late embryogenesis abundant protein (LEA14) from Arabidopsis thaliana, a cellular
 stress-related protein. Protein Sci. 2005;14:2601–9.
- Rinne P, Welling A, Kaikuranta P. Onset of freezing tolerance in birch (Betula pubescens
 Ehrh.) involves LEA proteins and osmoregulation and is impaired in an ABA-deficient genotype.
 Plant, Cell Environ. 1998;21:601–11.
- 83. Gagné-Bourque F, Mayer BF, Charron J-B, Vali H, Bertrand A, Jabaji S. Accelerated
 Growth Rate and Increased Drought Stress Resilience of the Model Grass Brachypodium
 distachyon Colonized by Bacillus subtilis B26. PLoS One. 2015;10:e0130456.
- 84. Nakashima K, Takasaki H, Mizoi J, Shinozaki K, Yamaguchi-Shinozaki K. NAC
 transcription factors in plant abiotic stress responses. Biochim Biophys Acta. 2012;1819:97–103.
- 85. Negi S, Tak H, Ganapathi TR. Expression analysis of MusaNAC68 transcription factor and
 its functional analysis by overexpression in transgenic banana plants. Plant Cell, Tissue Organ
 Cult. 2015;125:59–70.
- 716 86. Mao X, Chen S, Li A, Zhai C, Jing R. Novel NAC transcription factor TaNAC67 confers

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

- enhanced multi-abiotic stress tolerances in Arabidopsis. PLoS One. 2014;9:e84359.
- 718 87. Murakami M. The Evolutionarily Conserved OsPRR Quintet: Rice Pseudo-Response
- 719 Regulators Implicated in Circadian Rhythm. Plant Cell Physiol. 2003;44:1229–36.
- 720 88. Campoli C, Shtaya M, Davis SJ, von Korff M. Expression conservation within the circadian
- 721 clock of a monocot: natural variation at barley Ppd-H1 affects circadian expression of flowering
- time genes, but not clock orthologs. BMC Plant Biol. 2012;12:97.
- 723 89. Lee B, Henderson DA, Zhu J-K. The Arabidopsis cold-responsive transcriptome and its
- regulation by ICE1. Plant Cell. 2005;17:3155–75.
- 90. Wang G, Cai G, Kong F, Deng Y, Ma N, Meng Q. Overexpression of tomato chloroplast-
- targeted DnaJ protein enhances tolerance to drought stress and resistance to Pseudomonas
- solanacearum in transgenic tobacco. Plant Physiol Biochem. 2014;82:95–104.
- 91. Kong F, Deng Y, Zhou B, Wang G, Wang Y, Meng Q. A chloroplast-targeted DnaJ protein
 contributes to maintenance of photosystem II under chilling stress. J Exp Bot. 2014;65:143–58.
- 730 92. Yin Y, Mohnen D, Gelineo-Albersheim I, Xu Y, Hahn MG. Glycosyltransferases of the GT8
- Family. In: Annual Plant Reviews Volume 41: Plant Polysaccharides, Biosynthesis and
 Bioengineering. WILEY-BLACKWELL; 2011. p. 167–211.
- 733 93. Qi Y, Kawano N, Yamauchi Y, Ling J, Li D, Tanaka K. Identification and cloning of a
- submergence-induced gene OsGGT (glycogenin glucosyltransferase) from rice (Oryza sativa L.)
- by suppression subtractive hybridization. Planta. 2005;221:437–45.
- 94. Uddin MI, Kihara M, Yin L, Perveen MF, Tanaka K. Expression and subcellular localization
 of antiporter regulating protein OsARP in rice induced by submergence, salt and drought
 stresses. African Journal of Biotechnology. 2012;11:12849–55.
- 739 95. Hijmans RJ, Cameron SE, Parra JL, Jones PG, Jarvis A. Very high resolution interpolated
- climate surfaces for global land areas. Int J Climatol. 2005;25:1965–78.

741

Evolution of cold response in Pooideae

742 Supporting Information

743 Table S1. Summary statistics for the sampling, the transcriptome assembly, coding 744 sequence detection and ortholog group inference. Isoforms were not included in the counts. 745 Only ortholog groups with at least one coding transcript from the five studied species were 746 included.

Table S2. High confidence ortholog groups (HCOGs). HCOGs generated by filtering and
splitting ortholog groups (see Methods). Ortholog groups were stored as a table with the ortholog
group IDs as rows and species as columns. Each cell contains sequence IDs separated by ",".
Groups that were the result of splitting larger ortholog groups were marked by a number suffix in
the group ID.

Table S3. A cross species expression matrix. Combined read counts for high confidence ortholog groups. Column represents samples and rows represents HCOGs. The sample IDs in the column header consists of the species ID, the time point, indication of whether the sample is pooled from five individual plants ("mix") or just a single individual plant ("ind") and the replicate number.

757 Table S4. Differential expression results for the high confidence ortholog groups (HCOGs).

A table with rows representing HCOGs and columns representing differential expression results including log2 fold changes, P-values and FDR adjusted p-values for short- and long-term responses.

Figure S1: The four most common gene tree topologies. We generated gene trees from a
 selected set of 3914 ortholog groups (see Methods). This figure depicts the four most common
 topologies.